ferent

RAJYA SABHA

998—Tuesday, the 7th July, 1998/16 Asadha, 1920 (Saka)

House met at eleven of the clock, Mr. Chairman *in the Chair.*

MEMBER SWORN

Akhtar Hasan Rizvi (Uttar sh)

AL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

CHAIRMAN: Question No. 301.

opment of Agriculture Produce Marketing Committees

1. SHRI BRAHMAKUMAR TT: Will the Minister of RURAL AS AND EMPLOYMENT be ed to state:

whether it is a fact that the osal of the State Government of rat for revival of centrally sponsored ne for development of Agriculture uce Marketing Committees is under deration of Government;

if so, by when a decision will be a by Government; and

if not, the reasons therefor?

HE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE ISTRY OF RURAL AREAS AND PLOYMENT (SHRI BABAGOUDA IL): (a) The Ministry of Rural areas Employment has not received any proposal from the State Government Gujarat.

(b) and (c) Question does not arise.

श्री शमशेर सिंह सुरजेवाला: चेयरमैन सर, यह न ऐग्रीकल्चर मिनिस्टरी का क्वेश्चन है जो गलती से डैवलपमेंट को दिया गया है। ऐग्रीकल्चरल टिंग से रूरल डैवलपमेंट का कोई रिश्ता नहीं है ा इसका जवाब भी ठीक आया है।

राधवजी: ट्रांसफर कर दिया है।

श्री शमशेर सिंह सुरजेवाला: ट्रांसफर करना चाहिए। जस्टीफिकेशन तभी बनेगी।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Anyway, they have accepted it now. *(Interruptions)* Yes, Mr. Babagouda Patil, have you agreed?

SHRI BABAGOUDA PATIL: Yes, Sir. The reply is laid on the Table of the House. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI BRAHMAKUMAR BHATT: Mr. Chairman, Sir, is the hon. Minister aware that on the 12th...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: Sir, it is about the Agriculture Ministry. *(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Minister, have you accepted this question? Did your Ministry accept this question? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI BRAHMAKUMAR BHATT: Sir, he has not given the correct reply. *(Interruptions)* There are three letters that have been written. Three letters have been written and he says no communication has been received.

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: It is not his Ministry.

SHRI BRAHMAKUMAR BHATT: Then, why should he reply? *(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Sir, the Government is in utter confusion. *(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I agree that the question does not arise becasue it is not relevant to that Ministry. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: But then, it should have been transferred.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, it should be transferred...*(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Why did the Ministry accept it? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: Sir, I don't want to blame the Minister.

But when the question had gone, the Ministry should not have accepted it bacause it did not pertain to that Ministry. Instead of informing that to the Minister, they have misled the Parliament through this reply. I am not blaming the Minister. But the Parliament is not being taken very seriously. This is a very bad omen for this Parliament. It is not being taken seriously. *(Interruptions)* I think the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs should take it up. What is happening, Sir? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI BRAHMAKUMAR BHATT: Sir, I have got a fax message from a Minister of the Gujarat Government in which he has given dates.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Basically, the question is that this question does not relate to this Ministry.

SHRI BRAHMAKUMAR BHATT: Sir, this Ministry has received three letters from the State of Gujarat on 10.2.97, 25.11.97 and 8.5.98, and they have not given any reply. He should have stated that it does not belong to his Department. Why should he give a reply like this? The same Ministry has given three letters. Now, he is saying question does not arise. Question does arise. Three letters have been written to him. Please, check it up. Sir, my submission is let the Minister check it up properly from the Department and then come before the House with a corrected necessary answer.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Bhattji, the point is this question which they have admitted concerns them. As of now, your memorandums were not replied to by this Ministry and your memorandums would have gone to some other Ministry. Which Ministry have they gone to?

SHRI BRAHMAKUMAR BHATT: The letters were written to the same Ministry.

MR. CHAIRMAN: To whom?

SHRI BRAHMAKUMAR BHATT: These letters were written to the Department of Rural Development and Employment. it is the same Ministry ....*(Interruptions)* ...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, agricultural marketing comes under the Ministry of Rural Development...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI S.S. SURJEWALA: Sir, agricultural marketing comes under the Ministry of Agriculture. There are no agricultural marketing committees at the national level and the Central Government has nothing to do with agricultural marketing committees....*(Interruptions)* It is only a State subject. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI RAGHAVJI: Agricultural marketing is a State subject. It does not come under the Central Government ...*(Interruptions)* ...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, there is a Report listed in the Business Paper, a Report of the Committee, and it covers this area also. ...*(Interruptions)*... Agricultural marketing comes under the purview of the Rural Development Ministry.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There seems to be some genuine mistake on behalf of the Ministry and other Departments. ...*(Interruptions)* ...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Let us adjourn the House and let them find it out. ...*(Interruptions)* ... Maybe, they should ring up Jayalalitha. ... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Sir, let the question be postponed and you direct the hon. Minister to come up before the House with a proper reply. This subject is with him and he has erred; he has faulted; he is in the dock. It is the Minister who should have answered it. He has not answered it. Nobody is in the fault except the Minister. Sir, you call upon the Minister to come to the House on any other date and let the question be postponed. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: Sir, the hon. Member has produced photocopies of the letters written by the Gujarat Government to his Ministry. They did not receive any reply from him.

SHRI BRAHMAKUMAR BHATT: They have written not one but three letters. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI L.K. ADVANI: Sir, the hon. Member has suggested that it should be postponed. Let it be deferred to the day on which the Minister of Agriculture is to answer the questions, and on that day, it can be answered. ... *(Interruptions)* ...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: We maintain that it comes under that Ministry only. It is under the Ministry of Rural Development. *(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please speak one by one.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Sir, it is a wrong impression that the subject comes under the Ministry of Agriculture. It comes under the very same Ministry. I am suggesting, let the question be postponed because the Minister does not seem to have prepared himself and does not know the subject. Therefore, kindly order him to come before the House with proper information. ...*(Interruptions)* ...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Here, I have got the subjects of various Ministries and responsibilities. Under the Ministry of Rural Development, under Item No. 12, it is setting up of agricultural markets for agricultural produce in the rural areas, and grading and marketing the produce. It is coming under your Ministry, Mr. Minister. *(Interruptions)* That is why, what Mr. Surjewala has said is wrong. it is coming under this. The Member has raised a question whether the Minister has received those letters from the State Government. The Minister says that he has not received. The Member says that he has copies.

SHRI BABAGOUDA PATIL: I have not received any letter from the State Government but I have received letters from the Marketing Board. Not from the State Government. But the Member has asked if I have got any letter from the State Government. *(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: These letters are from the State Government or the Marketing Board?

SHRI BRAHMAKUMAR BHATT: This is a copy of the fax message received from the Minister of Gujarat, Ramlal Vora, which says that on 10.12.1997 and again on 25.11.1997 and 8.5.1998, letters were written to the Ministry of Rural Areas and Employment of the Government of India for which they are awaiting an answer. The Mininster says that he has not received the letters. I have got copies. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI BABAGOUDA PATIL: Sir, I am admitting that I have received letters from the Marketing Board but not from the State Government. *(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Anyway, you reply to that. The Minister says that he has received letters from the Marketing Board. Anyway, the subject is under you and you reply. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI BABAGOUDA PATIL: No letter from the State Government, Sir. *(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hear the supplementary and then reply properly. *(Interruptions)* Please sit down. Do not create more confusion now. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI BRAHMAKUMAR BHATT: I would like to know whether the hon. Minister in the Ministry of Rural Areas and Employment has received three letters from the Gujarat Minister, which I mentioned, or not. That is my first question. He should say 'yes' or 'no'.

SHRI BABAGOUDA PATIL: No. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI MD. SALIM: Whether your predecessors or your Ministry also....*(Interruptions)*

SHRI BRAHMAKUMAR BHATT: With the permission of the chairman I would like to place these letters, which are received, on the Table of the House. Let the hon. Chairman inquire whether

the Minister is giving the correct reply or whether the fact that the Gujarat Minister sent letters is correct. (*Interruptions*) Of these, who is correct?

SHRI S. R. BOMMAI: Let the Question be postponed.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is no question of postponement. It is valid to this Ministry. Do not create confusion. Please sit down. (*Interruptions*) He has raised this question whether the Minister of Gujarat has written a letter to him. The Union Minister say he has not got any letter from the Minister but from the Marketing Board. Supposing it is from the Marketing Board and the subject is also the same, would you reply to it, Mr. Minister?

SHRI BABAGOUDA PATIL: Sir, the scheme was transferred to the States on 31.3.1992 on the basis of a decision taken by the NDC in its meeting held in December, 1990-91. Thereafter, the States of Karnataka, Punjab, Meghalaya Marketing Boards have requested for returning the scheme to the Union Government. The State Governments have not requested. The then MOS had said that it was not possible to reconsider a decision taken by the NDC. Then, a high powered committee under the Chairmanship of Shankarlal Guru was constituted in 1992. Then the recommendation of the Shankarlal Guru Committee was discussed in the meeting of the Secretaries of the States and the Secretaries were told to come with the Chief Ministers for the new proposals. No State Government has requested...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Sir, this is only a wastage of time. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him reply. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI BRAHMAKUMAR BHATT: Is the Minister aware that on 22.12.95 a decision was taken in Delhi wherein Secretaries of the Departments of the State Governments were present and it was decided to take up this scheme Centrally? Is the hon. Minister aware of this?

SHRI BABAGOUDA PATIL: How can a decision of the NDC be reconsidered? In the meeting of the NDC, the chief Ministers...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him speak. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI BABAGOUDA PATIL: Sir, this subject has been transferred to the States in the meeting of the National Development Council. ..(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI TRILOKI NATH CHATURVEDI: The Minister has made it clear that the decision taken by the NDC cannot be reconsidered. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, here I have got a copy of the letter which has been written by Shri Ramlal Vora, Minister of State for Cooperation (Independent Charge) from Gandhinagar and sent to the hon. Minister for Rural Development. I do not know whether this has been received by his Ministry or not. That is number one. ...(*Interruptions*)... We have spent a lot of time on it. ...(*Interruptions*)... Let us not create more confusion. It will be better if you please meet him privately and discuss with him ...(*Interruptions*)... Let me finish. ...(*Interruptions*)... I know that. The question bascially is, he says, "I have not received that letter." ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S. S. AHULWALIA: Sir, with due respect I submit, do not create a bad precedent in this House. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I agree with you. ...(*Interruptions*)... The question now is: Can you give this letter? ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Sir, it is a very bad precedent which is being created here. ...(*Interruptions*)... Firstly, you are transferring a document which has not been authenticated. Sir, I most

respectfully submit that there are certain procedures and rules. Any document which is to be transacted and to be given must be authenticated. Secondly, once the Minister has said that he has not received any reply or any letter or any communication from the State Government, it becomes the property of the House. If the Minister has deliberately misled, then it is a case of privilege and this cannot be disposed of between the two persons, that is, the Minister and the private Member. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I agree with you. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Sir, most respectfully I submit, please do not act as a conduit for transferring a letter from a private Member to a Minister. Please do not do so. The Chair is much above these things. ...(*Interruptions*)... It should never be done. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please withdraw that letter. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right, I am withdrawing that letter. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: The Chair has a much larger prestige. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री सिकन्दर बख्तः आथान्टिकेट तो उनको करना है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: You please send that letter again to them separately. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Please do not give any direction. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please do not give any direction. We are going to take it up in a different forum. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Where do we stand now? He has said something which I have not heard. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: I am bringing a privilege motion against the Minister. Therefore, please do not make any commitment. You receive the privilege notice and thereafter in your wisdom you dispose it of because if you make yourself committed in either way, it will be embarrassing to the whole House. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right. ...(*Interruptions*)... I do not commit either way till I have seen it. Now, next question.

SHRIMATI KAMLA SINHA: Sir, what has happened to this Question?

श्री सभापतिः वह हो गया। **(व्यवधान)** नेक्स्ट क्वेश्चन। **(व्यवधान)** 20 मिनट हो गये हैं इस पर। **(व्यवधान)**

श्री राजूभाई ए० परमारः सभापति जी, इस क्वेश्चन का क्या हुआ?... **(व्यवधान)**

Sir, what will be the fate of this question?

राष्ट्रीय विद्युतकरघा विकास निगम की स्थापना किया जाना

*302. **श्रीमती शबाना आज़मी:**
श्री बलवन्त सिंह रामूवालिया:†

क्या वस्त्र मंत्री यह बताने की कृपा करेंगे किः

(क) क्या यह सच है कि विद्युतकरघा उद्योग के प्रतिनिधियों ने सरकार से मांग की है कि राष्ट्रीय विद्युतकरघा विकास निगम की स्थापना की जाए;

(ख) यदि हां, तो क्या यह भी सच है कि विगत में सरकार ने इस मांग को स्वीकार भी कर लिया था;

(ग) यदि हां, तो इस मांग को कार्यान्वित न किए जाने के क्या कारण हैं; और

(घ) इस निगम की स्थापना कब तक किये जाने का विचार है?

वस्त्र मंत्री (श्री काशीराम राणा): (क) से (घ) एक विवरण-पत्र सभा-पटल पर रख दिया गया है।

विवरण

जी हां। भारतीय विद्युतकरघा परिसंघ सहित विद्युतकरघा उद्योग के प्रतिनिधियों ने अन्य बातों के

† सभा में यह प्रश्न श्री बलवन्त सिंह रामूवालिया द्वारा पूछा गया।